

Reply to the queries in respect of the tender for Engagement of Consultant for Detailed Study on Identification of Suitable commercial use of vacant and occupied land at Haldia Dock Complex

**TENDER NUMBER: AD/E/764/LUP/TENDER/2017/1**

Sl. No	As Defined in the Tender Document	Tenderer's Query/Request/Suggestions	Clarification by Tender Committee
1.	<b>EVALUATION METHODOLOGY</b> (b) Selection of the successful tenderer for this assignment will be based on a technical and financial evaluation, with a weightage of 80:20	This tender clearly defines minimum technical standards for Consultancies to apply. While this is important and necessary prequalification but it provides final compilation of marks on the basis of 80:20 (80% for Technical and 20% for Financial quote). So, it becomes unduly over weight on Technical score. This clause may contribute little in ensuring better work but it will surely ensure higher cost to HDC. To balance out this, Technical and Financial may either be given 50:50 weightage or at best 60:40.  Also, this system tends to exclude out small and medium Indian enterprises.	<b>Can not be acceded to.</b>
2.	<b>(A) TECHNICAL CAPACITY Eligible Assignment</b> A minimum consultancy fee of Rs.80 lakhs during the period of last 7 years preceding the date of opening of Techno- Commercial bid.  <b>(B) FINANCIAL CAPACITY</b> The average Annual Financial Turnover of the tenderer during the last 3 (three) financial years shall be not less than Rs. 30 lakhs	2.1) You have fixed Rs. 80 lacs of Fee received to define 'Eligible Assignment'. (So, this suggest, budgeted cost of consultancy should be around this figure) However, your Turnover requirement is Rs. 30 lacs and duration of assignment is almost four months. So, firm should be able to do work of Rs. 80 lacs in four months. (i.e. yearly turnover above 2 Crore) However, prequalification norms of this tender makes firm eligible with turnover Rs. 30 lacs also. So, figures looks to be arbitrary.  2.2) You have also specified EMD of Rs. 2 lacs to be submitted. (which is normally 1% of estimated cost of work) This indicate budgeted cost of consultancy as per HDC is way beyond Rs. 80 lacs as analysed in above mentioned 2.1.  So, all three figures needs to be consistent in an unbiased and transparent manner.	<b>No change is recommended</b>
3	<b>EVALUATION CRITERIA AND SCORING OF TECHNO-COMMERCIAL BID.</b>	Your evaluation criteria in awarding marks to Technical strengths is based on percentile method which awards exponentially more marks to bidder in higher strength. Once, a basic technical strength has been met (by defining minimum technical standards), beyond that, firm with higher qualification should be awarded more marks on linear basis (rather than percentile). This means that you may define slabs with various level of expertise which are awarded graded marks.	<b>Can not be acceded to.</b>
4	<b>PROFESSIONAL EXPERIENCE &amp; EDUCATIONAL QUALIFICATION OF KEY PERSONNEL :-</b>  All the key resource persons must be associated with the tenderer as an employee.	You have asked all key Resource personnel to be an employee of the bidder. 4.1. This creates barrier and cut competition with clear favor towards large consultancies, most of them are multinational. 4.2. As the bid document ensures written consent of a professional of good standing (as per the format of CV), then there is no need for this clause. 4.3. Professional working as 'Associate' without being an 'Employee' is well established practice in India. This practice ensures gainful employment to professional, even in tougher economic times. 4.4. With other security features in place, responsible professional is no way less committed than any employee. 4.5. Not to mention, having such key personnel with Rs 30 lacs yearly turnover does not make any sense.	<b>No change is recommended</b>  Each resource person must be a permanent or a Contractual employee.
5	<b>Appendix-V (B)</b> from the beneficiary to the effect, that the bidder has undertaken part of the assignment and has been paid consulting fee of at least Rs. 80 lakhs (Rupees Eighty lakhs).	Sometimes certification to be obtained for past projects becomes impossible especially in government sector wherein, senior government officials get transferred every two years. In such cases, you may kindly allow corroboration of facts through self-certified supporting documents. In addition, you may ask for an Affidavit with stringent conditions.	<b>Can not be acceded to.</b>
6	<b>TIME SCHEDULE FOR COMPLETION OF THE ASSIGNMENT: -</b>  <b>Percentage of total fee to be paid</b> 1) 10% on Acceptance of the Concept Report by KoPT. 2) 50% on Submission of the Draft	Submission of Concept Plan – 10 % of fees Submission of Draft Report – 25 % of fees Submission of Draft Final Report – 35 % of fees Submission of Final Report – 30 % of fees  The above is suggested since all major exhaustive work has to be done by the consultant during the draft report stage, the other stages will be updation of the same based on mutual discussion	<b>Can not be acceded to.</b>

	Final Report. 3) 40% on Submission of Final Report.	and modifications.	
7	<b>SCOPE OF WORK:-</b> The consultant will submit a report suggesting utilization of the vacant and occupied lands of Haldia Dock Complex, Kolkata Port Trust to ensure optimum financial return. The report shall also contain measures to be taken by HDC/ KoPT for ensuring materialization of the suggestions of the consultants. .....	The scope of work given states the objectives of the work and the deliverables. We request you to specify the extend of details required for delivery	Please refer to the followings to get a clear idea :- a) Scope of Work at TOR of the Tender Document b) APPENDIX –XV
8	<b>TECHNICAL CAPACITY Eligible Assignment</b> A minimum consultancy fee of Rs.80 lakhs during the period of last 7 years preceding the date of opening of Techno- Commercial bid.	Request to reduce the eligible assignment consultancy fees of Rs. 80 Lacs to Rs. 40 Lacs.	<b>Can not be acceded to.</b>
9	<b>PROFESSIONAL EXPERIENCE &amp; EDUCATIONAL QUALIFICATION OF KEY PERSONNEL :-</b>  <b>Team leader-</b> Graduate in Civil Engineering /Architecture/ Town Planning. <b>Infrastructure Planning Expert-</b> Graduate in Civil Engineering / Architecture /Town Planning.	<b>Team leader-</b> Request that a Masters in Business Administration be considered as an alternative to Graduate in Civil Engineering /Architecture/ Town Planning.  <b>Infrastructure Planning Expert -</b> Request that a Masters in Business Administration be considered as an alternative to Graduate in Civil Engineering /Architecture/ Town Planning.	<b>Can not be acceded to.</b>
10	<b>SCORING METHODOLOGY SECTION A:</b> Relevant Experience of tenderer : (Total points 40 ) (i) Number of eligible assignments undertaken by the bidder over the past 7 (seven) years preceding the date of opening of the Techno-Commercial Bid: (Totalpoints 20 ) This aspect would be ranked on percentile basis with the proposal indicating highest number of eligible assignments getting full points, i.e. 20	We Request that the maximum number of projects for maximum points in this clause be capped at the lower of 10 projects and the maximum projects across bidders	<b>Can not be acceded to.</b>
11	<b>SCORING METHODOLOGY SECTION C :</b> Area of expertise of key personnel (b) The respective total / maximum marks of evaluation in respect of each of the key personnel is provided below: - Team leader cum Project Coordinator - 15 points Infrastructure Planning Expert-10 pt Marketing Expert -7.5 points Financial Expert -7.5 points  (c) The methodology of scoring in respect of each of the key personnel is provided below :-  (i) Number of eligible assignments undertaken by the key personnel concerned: (Total points =60%of total pointsforthekeypersonnelconcerned as indicated at Section-C (b) above ) (ii) Years of experience of the key personnel (both eligible and other assignments) : (Total points = 40% of total points for the key personnel concerned as indicated at Section-C (b)	We Request that the maximum number of projects for maximum points in this clause be capped at the lower of 5 projects and the maximum projects across bidders.	<b>Can not be acceded to.</b>

	above)		
12	<p><b>ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA FOR TENDERERS:</b></p> <p><b>(A) TECHNICAL CAPACITY</b> Minimum number of eligible assignment in India or abroad during the period of last 7 years preceding the date of opening of Techno-Commercial bid.</p> <p>1 (one) Eligible Assignment for a minimum consultancy fee of Rs.80 lakhs.</p>	Considering the nature and scale of the scope of work, we understand that the minimum consultancy fee should be INR 15 Lakhs. We would request you to kindly reconsider the stated consultancy fee.	<b>Can not be acceded to.</b>
13	<p><b>ELIGIBILITY CRITERIA FOR TENDERERS:</b></p> <p><b>(B) FINANCIAL CAPACITY</b></p> <p>The average Annual Financial Turnover of the tenderer during the last 3 (three) financial years shall be not less than Rs. 30 lakhs (Rupees Thirty Lakhs only).</p>	We understand that the annual financial turnover during the last 3 (three) financial years should not be less than INR 100 crores. We would request you to kindly elevate the stated figure.	<b>Can not be acceded to.</b>
14	<p><b>APPENDIX- XV</b> Details of KoPT land at Haldia Total Area in Commercial Zone = 71 acres.</p>	The total commercial zone area mentioned is 71 acres. We seek clarity on the total area of the land parcel here concerned for identification of commercial use of vacant and occupied land at Haldia Dock Complex.	Out of 71 acres about 12.6 acres allotted to port users on Lease/License basis, rest about 58.40 acres is kept for future use for commercial purpose.
15	<p><b>SCORING METHODOLOGY</b></p> <p><b>SECTION A:</b> Relevant Experience of tenderer : (Total points 40 ) (i) Number of eligible assignments undertaken by the bidder over the past 7 (seven) years preceding the date of opening of the Techno-Commercial Bid: (Total points 20 ) This aspect would be ranked on percentile basis with the proposal indicating highest number of eligible assignments getting full points, i.e. 20</p>	This sub-clause (i) indicates towards the scoring methodology for securing a total of 20 marks. We understand that without stating any upper limit for the number of projects, the percentile method of scoring would create an uncertainty in the result outcome. We would request you to kindly sort the ambiguity.	It is not based on marks but on points. A Tenderer will achieve full points (i.e. 20/20) if he have undertaken maximum number of eligible assignments in the last 7 years in compared to other tenderers.
16	<p><b>SCORING METHODOLOGY</b></p> <p><b>SECTION C :</b> Area of expertise of key personnel (Total points 40) (a) Eligible assignments undertaken shall mean completed assignments related to Preparation of Report / DPR pertaining to Land Use Plan / Master Plan / Town Plan/ Multimodal Logistic Park/ SEZ/ Industrial Park , costing not less than Rs. 50 lakhs (Rupees Fifty Lakhs only).</p>	The sub-clause (a) states the costing for eligible assignments of completed projects as Rs. 50 lakhs, which has not been mention anywhere in the RFP as cost for eligible assignment. We seek clarity on this stated cost.	Key Personnel will be scored on basis of Assignment completed for consultancy fee not less than Rs. 50 lakhs related to Preparation of Report / DPR pertaining to Land Use Plan / Master Plan / Town Plan/ Multimodal Logistic Park/ SEZ/ Industrial Park.
17	<p><b>SCORING METHODOLOGY</b></p> <p><b>SECTION C :</b> Area of expertise of key personnel (Total points 40) (c) The methodology of scoring in respect of each of the key personnel is provided below :- <u>For Team leader</u> a. More than 20 years :- Total points b. Between 15 years to 20 years:- 90% of Total points</p>	We would request you to kindly consider the number of years stated for a team leader from 20 years to 15 years	<b>Can not be acceded to.</b>
18	Date of Closing of Online e-tender for submission of Techno-Commercial Bid & Price Bid: 31.05.2017 at 1430 hrs	Considering the extensive work required to draft the entire documentation for preparing the bid, we understand that adequate time would be required for which we would request you to kindly extend the last date of submission by at least 2 weeks from the date of receiving reply to the queries.	<b>Can not be acceded to.</b>